

**Montclair Historic Preservation Commission**

**Application No.:** 2833

**Project Location:** 509 Park Street (Block 2710, Lot 29)

**Received by Connolly & Hickey:** 16 August 2023 **Reviewed:** 13 September 2023

The main house on the property is a Colonial Revival with Shingle style influences constructed circa 1900 as a single-family residence and was individually surveyed as part of the "Preservation Montclair" Inventory of Historic Properties. This house faces west toward Park Street and retains a high degree of architectural integrity. Per historic images provided through research conducted by the Montclair HPC, the garage, located northeast of the main house, was constructed in 1914. The stone site wall located along the west side of the property was constructed in 1921. Julien Tinkham was a partner in a brokerage firm and also owned Applegate Farms after retiring in 1912. This property, per historic images, connected with his property at Applegate Farms and the construction of the existing garage, of terra cotta block, matches the material of the silo, which remains today. Also, per historic images, Tinkham made improvements to his residential property and Applegate Farms at the same time including rebuilding barns that were set close to the subject property garage. The garage was constructed for the Tinkham's automobile during a time in newly emerging suburbs when automobiles became more prevalent and garages became more common. The garage is distinctive in that it was built of not only the terra cotta block, a fireproof and rot-proof material, but its hip roof was also clad with slate.

**Project Description:** The applicant proposes to subdivide the existing lot to create a total of three lots, one of which will contain the existing house, all with frontage on Park Street. The subdivision will preserve the existing detached garage on proposed lot 29.01. In addition, the stone wall located along the front property line will be preserved except for two new driveway entrances. The existing brick garden walls in the front yard of lot 29.03 and the stone walls near the detached garage on proposed lot 29.01 will be preserved.

**Project Comments:**

The following comments are based on a set of drawings provided by J. Michael Petry, Architect and Petry Engineering, dated 6 & 7 July 2023, the Historic Design Guidelines for the Township of Montclair, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and are meant as an observation against historical precedent and understands that the proposed subdivision and building form does not necessarily require an exact holding to precedent as long as the design fits within the aesthetic of the neighborhood/district.

1. Based on a review of the history and development of 509 Park Street, subdivision of this property is not recommended. The site was developed, including the site walls, brick garden walls, and other features per the Tinkham family's designs. As previously noted, the Tinkham property, including in its current form, represents

**Application No.:** 2833

**Project Location:** 509 Park Street (Block 2710, Lot 29)

Page 2 of 2

the transition in Montclair's history and development from primarily agricultural to commuter suburb within a shrinking agricultural landscape. Tinkham's development of Applegate Farm is a snapshot of this period in time and 509 Park Street is a fine representation of this snapshot that retains a high degree of architectural integrity as seen in the main house, the garage, the site wall, the brick garden walls and other garden features, and the property's position in the landscape and relationship to Park Street. As noted by the Montclair's Assistant Planner, it has been determined through a recent study of the Commuter Area Potential Historic District that the east side of Park Street should be considered part of this district. Looking more closely at Tinkman's role in the development of Upper Montclair at a period of significant change and development, inclusion of this property in the potential historic district has been further reinforced. Breaking up the property and the construction of two new homes that have no architectural connection to Park Street is not recommended and has the potential to jeopardize its future listing on the New Jersey and National Registers of Historic Places as a historic district.